1) **List of Abbreviations**

2) **Acknowledgements**

This integrated assessment on trafficking body parts in the GLTP was carried out by SANTAC research, communication and advocacy unit in partnership with League for Human Rights in Mozambique (LDH). This assessment is partial fulfilment of wider human rights protection mechanisms advocated for by LDH and its national and international partners. SANTAC passes gratitude through the LDH Executive Director Dr Maria Alice Mabota, for funding this study. Many thanks go to Chcualacuala District Police, Administrative Authorities and IMBISA (Mozambique), Chiredzi South District Administrator’s Office and Police Internal Security Intelligence (Zimbabwe) and Chief Nemalale (RSA) notwithstanding their teams who gave unwavering support to the project. Gratitude are also extended to respondents whose humility and understanding cannot be matched and will be cherished forever more. Finally yet importantly, acknowledgements are passed to the executive coordination and research teams that included the video technicians, field assistant, data collectors and key informants who tirelessly worked sometimes in very difficult conditions.

2) **Acknowledgements**
3) **Dedication**

This report is dedicated to the victims of trafficking body parts who largely are families of those who departed because of forced death perpetrated for extracting their body parts and used for unknown purposes.

4) **Table of Contents**

5) **Executive Summary**

SANTAC has successfully brought out sufficient evidence of existence of trafficking body parts as perpetrated in Mozambique, Zimbabwe and South African region of the Great Limpopo Trans-Frontier Park. 250 respondents participated in the 15 day integrated assessment of the region. Quantitative and qualitative methodologies were used through structured questionnaires, semi-structured and structured interviews including randomly selected individuals. 94% (234) respondents acknowledged existence of trafficking body parts of which 88% (220) respondents fear this kind of crime more than any other form human rights abuse perpetrated by organized criminals allegedly based in South Africa. Residents of the GLTP and adjacent districts live in perpetual fear and are insecure because of ill-equipped and inadequately trained law enforcement agents to curb trafficking body parts. The research uncovered serious need to disseminate available legislation through local and regional networks and improve protection of human rights. Advocacy and lobbying activities are necessary now more than ever as criminal cartels are becoming more sophisticated ahead of effective law implementation and enforcement. Of the three countries, only Mozambique in tier 2 marginally conforms to UN standard principles having ratified and promulgated law 6/2008 of 9 July. Meanwhile South Africa approved anti-trafficking law in August 2013 while the Government of Zimbabwe does not comply with the minimum standards for the elimination of trafficking and is not making significant efforts to do so. Zimbabwe has no law that prohibits trafficking. Although senior government officials continued to voice interest in trafficking issues, including national awareness campaign on trafficking tangible efforts to investigate and prosecute trafficking offenses, including those allegedly involving government officials, and to protect victims remained minimal. It was found out that Zimbabwe and Mozambique are sources, transit and to a lesser extent destination of trafficking body parts. 71% (178) respondents claim that the destination of trafficking body parts is South Africa where some witchdoctors show knowledge and tact of making someone rich by mixing “Muti” and live human body parts. Poverty, greediness and unemployment seem to be the main push factors while availability of witchdoctors claiming to make someone rich over night are pull factors. The research uncovered that 80% (12/15) cases of people who met their death by force had their genitals removed when bodies were found. The removal of these parts was exploitative in nature because targeted vulnerable people died demonstrating that perpetrators were vicious and determined to extract body parts of their choice at even someone lost life. It seems that ambitious people involved in various business ventures especially those of Asiatic and Indian origins working in collaboration with local Africans were cited as main culprits at the forefront of the criminal activities.

6) **Definition of Terms**

   a) **Trafficking body parts** - as transportation or movement of a body part blood or tissue, either across borders or within the country for sale, commercial transaction or harmful traditional practices.
b) **Victim** - is a family member of the deceased whose death was caused by force by perpetrator(s) with purposes of extraction of body parts.

c) **Traditional Healer** - is someone endowed with ancestral spirits and able to treat an ailment using consultations thereof on how to resolve problems of the client for his/her own good.

d) **Witchdoctors** - Someone with knowledge traditional medicines but not necessarily endowed with ancestral spirits but might have seen or exposed to traditional medical practices. The witchdoctor works in cohorts with witches and callous people whose aim is evil.

e) **Extraction of body parts** - Removal of human body parts of choice from a vulnerable target individual.

f) **Muti** - A mixture of traditional concoctions usually meant to heal specific ailment.

g) **Curandeiro, N’anga or Sangoma** – Local terms used to describe a traditional healer in Mozambique, Zimbabwe and South Africa respectively.

7) **Research Team**

   **Lead Consultant**
   - Joseph Matongo

   **Executive Coordination**
   - Margarida Gutunga and Paula Mondlane

   **Communication**
   - Hannah M. Taylor

   **Video Technicians**
   - Mathias Guenard
   - Pierre Bussiere

   **Field Assistant**
   - Gerald Nondo

   **Data Collectors**
   1) Naki Sani Benson Munyai – Musina (RSA)
   2) Nacoto Benardo Chicualacuala – (Mozambique)
   3) Selome Mayeyisa Chiredzi South (Zimbabwe)

   **Data Capturer**
   - Munyaradzi Matongo

8) **Graphs and Pictures**

   a) Figure 1) Chief Nemalale’s Village Court

   b) Figure 2) Traditional Healer Nemadimbo Sara Tivutse

   c) Figure 3) The Great Limpopo Trans-Frontier Park

   d) Figure 4) Total number of respondents by country disaggregated by gender

   e) Figure 5) Number of respondents who have heard about human rights abuses

   f) Figure 6) Kinds of abuses most feared in area of study

   g) Figure 7) Number of respondents who have seen a mutilated body

   h) Figure 8) Body parts found missing

4
9) **Introduction**

The aim of this integrated assessment was to find out if there is evidence of trafficking body parts in the Great Limpopo Trans-frontier Park consisting of Limpopo and Banhine (Mozambique), Gonarezhou (Zimbabwe) and Kruger National Park (South Africa). The GLTP is a 3-country tripartite wildlife conservation and management authority covering 41,439.8 km². GLTP was selected for this study, firstly, there were reports of suspected ritual murder cases, child disappearances, uncontrolled, illegal cross border movements, human and contraband smuggling. Secondly, the GLTP lies in where communication is a challenge, poor cross border security surveillance, non-existent employment chances, far distanced education, health facilities, minimal agricultural production because it lies in semi arid region with very low economic opportunities. The ongoing road construction to serve Gaza west province is bringing potential economic opportunities and commercialization on the Mozambican side of the trans-frontier region. The convergence areas of the three countries under study encourage young productive and employable people migrate into RSA leaving single mothers and old people caring for families. Furthermore, the relocation of 20 000 people on the Mozambican side giving way for free roaming of animals from Kruger National Park after the removal of the 120 km electric fence makes the already vulnerable women, children and girls more susceptible to impact trafficking body parts. According to authorities old clothes and shoes known to be cheap in Mozambique cannot enter Zimbabwe officially, but truckloads of the same commodities are smuggled at will using the GLTP route which shows how porous the borders are.

The geographical area of study covered districts of Chicualacuala in Mozambique, Chiredzi South and BeitBridge in Zimbabwe, Vhembe and Nkomazi of South Africa. The research team included a lead consultant three data collectors, 1 field assistant and two video technicians. Both quantitative and qualitative methods were used in workshops, focus group discussions and randomly selected respondents. Both structured and semi-structured interviews and questionnaires were used as data collection tools. A total of 250 people were reached during the study among them including immigration officials, border guards, health and education personnel, shop owners, transport operators, police, church/community leaders, traditional healers, NGOs/CSOs staff, security, various Ministerial level officials, farmers, students, vendors and lay people in villages were interviewed as key informants. 65 were randomly selected individual respondents, 170 workshop participants made up 15 focus groups and 15 victimized families responded either to the structured questionnaire, structured or to unstructured interviews. Although we had letters for permission, respective country bureaucracies hindered data collection and access to relevant information sources. For purposes of this research, SANTAC partnered District PRM commanding Chicualacuala, Mapai and Pafuri administrative posts, IMBISA representative of Gaza west, FMAST and Paramount Chief Nemalale in Mozambique, Zimbabwe and RSA respectively. It has to be mentioned that the research team had intended using Pafuri Border Post as entry point into Nkomazi.
district of RSA but the border post was closed due to rehabilitation process after the floods. Vhembe district was opted for because of its adjacency to both Musina/BeitBridge and Pafuri border entry points. In addition, Paramount Chief Nemalale represents other chiefs so information was likely to be forthcoming. Many cases of trafficking body parts were reported in that area including one of a courageous young 12-year-old boy Phalenndwa Tshiawelo who rescued 3-year-old girl from an unmarked vehicle that he intercepted before it sped off the village.

10) Research Objective

To find out and document cases of killings / mutilations for purposes of trading in body parts, and strengthen protection mechanisms in SADC part of the GLTP.

11) Research Questions

1) Have you ever heard of human rights abuses?
2) State the kinds of abuse you fear most.
3) Have you ever seen a mutilated body with body parts, blood or tissues missing,
4) Have you seen a body part, blood, or tissue after it has been removed from a body,
5) Have you ever been attacked and body parts, tissue, or blood removed or attempted to be removed.
6) What do you think perpetrators do with extracted body parts, blood or tissues?
7) Where do they take the removed body part, blood or tissue from the dead person?

12) Research Methods

This assessment included a combination of qualitative and quantitative analysis from semi-structured questionnaires and interviews used in all 3 countries of study.

a) Desk review of related literature
   o Media reports
   o Resource Materials and Referrals
   o Personal Consultations with NGOs/CSOs and individuals in human rights protection

b) Workshops
   o Open and honest environment
   o Multiple sectors – gender sensitivity

c) Focus Group Discussions
   o Less structured
   o Individual interviews
   o Spontaneous debate of face to face

13) UN Palermo Protocol Definition of Trafficking Body Parts

This project took cognisance of the fact that extraction of any body part, blood and tissue for whatever purpose was never an act of consent, but force leading to death hence it was exploitation. It was found out that in the act of exploitation, coercion, deceit or abuse of power was used as means to extract body parts. According to the Palermo Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children, supplementing the UN Convention against Transnational Organized Crimes (2000)
states that, “Trafficking in persons shall mean the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons, by means of threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, abduction, fraud, deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve consent of a person having control over another person for the purposes of exploitation” According to Article 3 of the Palermo Protocol, exploitation may include sexual exploitation like forced marriages, pornography, forced labour, slavery, servitude or removal of organs. Therefore for this project movement of a body part, blood, tissue either across a border or within a country for the purpose of sale, commercial transaction or harmful traditional practices shall be deemed trafficking body parts.

This report cites that crimes against humanity were perpetuated and continue increasing against lack of national laws and internationally agreed definition of trafficking body parts. 15th Session of the Commission on Crime Prevention and Criminal Justice in Vienna, 24-28 April 2006, Item 6 of the Provisional Agenda states that, “a global comparison of trafficking in human organs and tissues is constrained by the lack of a uniform definition and the absence of consistent statistics and criminal reports.” Southern Africa is trapped in dearth of lack of harmonized regional legislation let alone country by country implementation of what is in existence. RSA ratified the UN Palermo Protocol in 2004, The Children’s Act No 38 of 2005 that improves Child Care and Protection System. However, domestication of the trafficking in persons was only signed into law in August 2013. In Zimbabwe no law has been enacted The USAID TIP Report of 2012 says, “The Government of Zimbabwe made minimal anti-trafficking law enforcement efforts during the year. It did not investigate or prosecute trafficking offenses, and neither finalized nor introduced a comprehensive anti-trafficking bill to the cabinet. Zimbabwean law does not prohibit all forms of trafficking in persons. This explains why Zimbabwe is categorized in tier 3 signifying a country that has nothing to show as conforming with UN Palermo Protocol. Mozambique on tier 2 has enacted trafficking in person’s law 6/2008 of 9 July. However, it is suffering from minimal clarity in interpretation and implementation thereof. There is lack of adequately trained police officers to pursue investigations until prosecutions. To substantiate these scenario only two officers were capacitated in Gaza province to adequately respond to the crime of trafficking body parts. On arrival at Chicualacuala Border Police Station we found out the recently trained officer had not yet been allocated office and equipment to officially commence his job depicting unpreparedness of the police force to mitigate TIP. On the Zimbabwean side the police could not divulge the number of cases they officially received regarding trafficking body parts possibly pointing out lack of legislation to support acts of the crime.

14) Working Definition of Trafficking Body Parts

LDH research report (2010:20) defines trafficking body parts as transportation or movement of a body part blood or tissue, either across borders or within the country for sale, commercial transaction or harmful traditional practices. For purposes of this report trafficking in body parts occurs when a person is found dead due to forced death or unnatural causes but showing evidence that some of the body parts are missing and have been removed by a sharp instrument. In all cases this research uncovered victims died.

Ritual murders or put simply trafficking human body parts is rampant in the region under study. The push factors are poverty and lack of employment opportunities. People resort to using live human body parts as unorthodox means to acquire riches, power and social status. This research uncovered pull factors as availability of market demand for body parts by business cartels working with Curandeiros, N’angas and
Sangomas or simply; witchdoctors as they are referred to in Mozambique, Zimbabwe and South Africa respectively.

Nemadimbo Sara Tivavutse is a certificated under the South Africa Traditional Healers Act..................She is a Traditional Healers Provincial Committee member who claim to be endowed with ancestral powers, “We do not believe that mixture of body parts with traditional medicines is something done by truthful healers but witches. If anyone comes to seek advice I do not jump into treating but seek direction from the spiritual world by casting bones thereby I will also be given instructions on what to do and how. Never will ancestral spirits tell someone to bring human body parts, blood or tissue to resolve ones’ problem. During our provincial meetings we have been warned and informed of malpractices by some of us who were caught and jailed in Thoyohandou for mixing Muti and body parts in their professions.” Witchdoctors are alleged to be knowledgeable of the kinds of concoctions used for good and evil purposes of which the latter will be mixed with different body parts that enhance riches immediately. Although most respondents cited beneficiaries as business people of Asiatic background, it was posited that they work with local people who study and identify types of victims like twins, albinos, very poor people and drunkards. Families were assumed not to have capacity to pursue prosecution of perpetrators. Social anthropological ethnographies have documented anecdotes of Muti murders in Southern Africa since the 1800’s and research have shown that incidents of Muti murder increases in times of political and economic stress. Mozambique, Zimbabwe and South Africa are countries coming out or are still in such stress. Another dimension to this crime is the rise of satanic cult, which is spreading fast in this region. The rise of satanic occults although unexplored phenomena have taken the region by surprise. Mass deaths occurring from bus accidents are associated with satiating blood needs of operators and enhance success in their businesses. One informant, a survivor of a fatal Zimbabwe bus accident in June 2012 claimed to have seen 3 naked women taking organs from injured passengers. Reports professing membership to satanic occults include demanding human body parts usable during religious practices and sacrifices. The existence of extraction of body parts for traditional practices is an old phenomenon in African history although the terminology trafficking body parts for commercial purposes is relatively new.
15) **Historical Background**

African Traditional Religion practices of appeasement of avenging spirits were common in some parts of Southern African especially Zimbabwe. Appeasement of avenging spirit was an act of presenting a live human being usually a girl or boy to the aggrieved family. The aggrieved family might have had a murdered or seriously wronged member whose appeasement would be payable with a live human body. The “payments” would be either forced to marry in the aggrieved family if it is a girl or a boy would work his entire life to the satisfaction of the aggrieved. However, history says at times some of these “payments” would be killed dying excruciatingly painful deaths. These were marked as signs of revenge hence appeasing the spirits of the departed. Pledging a female for forced marriage or to compensate for the death of a relative or any debt or obligation is now punishable under The Criminal Law (Codification and Reform) Act, with penalties of up to two years’ imprisonment. None of these penalties, however, are commensurate with penalties prescribed for other serious crimes, such as rape. Some cruel warriors tasked with the killings were allegedly accused of extracting body parts as signs of valour. The writer is shedding light on this historical background to inform beneficiaries to the research findings why people have turned to dependency on live body parts for ascendancy of power, authority and wealth; fearlessness was a prerequisite. In wartimes bringing the head or smoking heart of an opponent capped what a commander was expected of. This was the birth of greediness, although not recorded in any historical books but by virtue of association, people started clandestine escapades to murder vulnerable individuals for extracting body parts. In some cases ritual murders could not be stopped by law as it seemed they were sanctioned by traditional and customary laws which at times contradict penal laws of the countries under study. However, with implosion of greediness for individualism, self-advancement, the practice was and is being manipulated by opportunists who need quick fix of community power and status. However, it has been highly difficult to prove and ascertain how business grew make one rich immediately as a result of mixing his Muti medicine with a specific prescribed body part, blood, or tissue of a living human being.

16) **Summary of Research Findings**

The findings prove existence of ritual murders and extraction of body parts used clandestinely by highly organized and sophisticated criminals. The study shows that there is relaxed and porous cross-border security surveillance hence a lot of illegal migration by unaccompanied children on the move, vulnerable women. There is evidence of smuggling trends both human and contraband. Furthermore, there is lack of information on protective mechanisms in all three countries sharing the borders within the GLTP and adjacent districts. This offers a fertile environment for increased operations for perpetrators trading in body parts. The following key results findings prove the above assertion;

- 94% (234) respondents acknowledged existence of the practice of extracting body parts, they feel law enforcement is weak.

- In Mozambique, not enough has been done to equip law enforcement agents to conduct investigations leading to prosecution of perpetrators. (Gaza Province has only two Police Officers recently trained in Anti-Trafficking)
Police in all countries demand that aggrieved should show and prove evidence by bringing the perpetrator to the station with instrument and the body part removed from the victim to believe existence of trafficking in body parts. (showing a dead body with missing parts is not enough)

In all three countries it is embarrassing to law enforcement agents not to be able to conclude investigations into trafficking body parts due to inadequacies of legislation.

88% (220) respondents cited murders for extraction of body parts as the most feared human rights abuse.

29% (72) respondents have seen, 55% (138) respondents have never seen while 16% (40) respondents have heard about a mutilated body.

85% (213) respondents believe body parts are mixed with muti (traditional concoctions) to enhance people’s business ventures, farming, and individual social status or acquire wealth. While 15% (37) respondents said parts are sold.

30% (75) respondents have seen a mutilated body without some of its body parts.

80% (12 of the 15) murder victims were found without their genitals all allegedly removed at time of death.

71% (178) respondents said body parts are taken to South Africa while 17% (42) and 12% (30) respondents said go to Mozambique and Zimbabwe respectively.

17) Delimitation of Study

This study was purposive and focused in the GLTP of Limpopo and Banhine, Kruger and Gonarezhou National Parks in Mozambique, RSA and Zimbabwe respectively including adjacent districts. Adjacent districts were included because administrative authorities running the GLTP are not within the trans-frontier park itself. The research team discovered that perpetrators came from far away places and use the GLTP as transit route. Adjacent districts are some of the remotest regions in all three countries. As a conservation game park entity, GLTP stretches on vast thickets of forests rendering the geographical location ideal for secretive and clandestine movements of criminal networks possible. Many people travel along western border of Mozambique as far afield as from southern districts of Machaze, Espungabeira in Manica province, Machanga, Chibabava in Sofala province and Massangena, Mapai, Chicaluacuala, Chibuto, Massingir and Chigubo in Gaza Province. This study enables SANTAC and Humanitarian actors/partners to extrapolate data and become informed on designing appropriate and effective response actions.
18) Limitations of the Study

a) Financial constraints limited the research study time, workshops, wider coverage and hiring adequate data collectors.

b) The three countries do not have specific legislation against trafficking body parts but depend on borrowing articles and subsections from trafficking in persons laws.

c) The administrative authorities of Zimbabwe and Mozambique were too bureaucratic to allow authorization of the research team. This led to fewer respondents reached although longer time was spent between the two countries.

d) Mozambicans are conservative people and were not at liberty to share information even if they knew cases around them.

e) Police are not adequately trained to handle intense investigations even when one is found dead with body parts removed.

f) Closure of Pafuri border post for rehabilitation due to floods of early 2013 made it difficult accessing the Nkomazi district from Chicualacuala.

g) Trafficking body parts is a highly sensitive issue hence needed the Government of Mozambique’s letter of authorization to facilitate access to information sources.

19) Data Presentation and Analysis

Sample Population Size

The table below shows the total number of respondents interviewed in each country disaggregated by gender. There was no equality between male and female representation. Reasons varied by country: in Mozambique there were more men than women because men have more time readily available while women have lesser time as their household chores takes up all the time. Men were also ready to talk and give information while women not. It was the same in Zimbabwe but different in South Africa. If one looks at the Chief’s court on figure one women are more than men. Men are at work far away from home in the mines, factories and plantations. It was also discovered than women were more vocal in South Africa in focus group discussions about the insecurity and fear of ritual murders they blamed on men living and working in large cities like Johannesburg where competition is high hence resorting to quick wealth. South African women called upon law enforcement agents to clamp down on street corner
witchdoctors who advertise their trades on every notice board claiming to be the answer to people’s problems. Irene Munyai said, "You can’t walk to the end of any street in Johannesburg before you see a poster advertising these so-called problem solvers instead they are problem-causers.”

The research team conducted qualitative interviews with residents to gain a deeper understanding of how they perceive impact of trafficking body parts. Community leaders in Bairro 4 de Outubro at Mapai Administrative Post in Chicualacuala District demonstrated anger why such heinous acts are still allowed to happen in times of perceived peace. Mr Pedro Malashe Chitlangu said, “I am very concerned with lack of punishment on killers because wherever one goes these crimes are heard all over. I was in Maputo a couple of weeks ago when I also heard that in Magude district people had their knee ligaments removed. "The research team also heard the community leader saying, “It is time to mobilize communities to be vigilant and protect our people because it seems this type of crime will be here for a long time.” 88% of the total respondents feel unsafe of trafficking body parts perpetrators. It seems people from the three countries are resigned to live with this type of human rights abuse because they do not know what to do. Trafficking body parts has been going on for a long time without effective deterrents. It was also discovered that the criminals do not hit the same area twice at a time. They take time before revisiting the same area. They give time for people to forget then hit again. This is why Mr Pedro suggests formation and training of vigilant teams to keep a continuous eye on people twenty-four hours and seven days a week.
94% (234) respondents have heard about human rights abuses related to trafficking body parts while 6% (16) respondents have never heard. It seems people are aware of their rights more through word of mouth circulating in their communities. Chief Malale of Vhembe District said, “here we have formal periodic gatherings where we talk and share plans, problems and experiences. It is during these meetings that we warn our people of any problems currently experienced locally. These are platforms where we inform people of Government activities. Now and again we receive people like you here and that is only how our people learn of what is happening elsewhere.” However, it was discovered that no laws pertaining to combating trafficking body parts or persons had been discussed in Chief Nemalale’s court. The workshop participants were asked if any other laws were ever discussed among the people, the Chief said he once brought some discussion points on Children’s Protection about 10 years ago and nothing thereafter. Residents of Mapai Administrative Post in Chicualacuala District shared similar experiences when asked why they are not open with information, Ernesto Dumazi Matuasa the community leader Bairro 4 Outubro where an 11 year old boy disappeared for a month and was found dead naked, said, “we live like animals who survive on the laws of the jungle not human rights. Every time we are told organize your people we are coming to talk to you about some laws of the country, because it is your right to know the laws that govern you, we call for meetings they do not come. We only see them when they come to tell us who to vote for and everyone talks on top of their voices that its our right to vote for candidate of our choice. If it was not for the NGOs we would not see anyone here” Jorge Chauque was found with no clothes on him.
88% (220) respondents fear ritual murders and frightens them the most. However, they are not at liberty to talk about them openly. This could be partly due to lack of protection from law enforcement agents because of perceived harassment accompanied by divulging information. In almost all cases law enforcement agents claimed to come back with responsive action but no arrests were made, suspects are still roaming the streets. Secondly, residents have fear of the unknown from perpetrators. They do not want to be known as front-runners exposing the heinous acts. Informants would rather keep to themselves because if perpetrators can kill and go away with victims’ body parts without any police reprisals, then, they can visit the whistleblower and silence him/her. In addition, trafficking body parts is highly coordinated and well resourced crime against humanity, perpetrators can hire killers and corrupt their ways to silence even law enforcement agents. Furthermore, the countries under study have recently enacted laws combating the crime but communities especially those on the periphery and remote parts have yet to be made aware of such provisions in friendly versions to interpret and utilize them for their protection.
29% (72) respondents have seen a mutilated body while 55% (138) respondents have not. 16% (40) respondents have only heard of mutilated bodies. Respondents who have seen a mutilated body could be close to the families of the deceased or villagers involved in searching missing person who eventually will be found dead with parts extracted. It is alleged that as soon as villagers were alerted of someone missing, they organized communally, search teams that would look around while others alert the local police. It is however reported that although police were given reports whenever someone disappears they were not very helpful during the search except filing the information. 29% is almost a third of the total respondents which paints a picture depicting a possibility that one in every three people in the areas of study might at one point in life be subjected to seeing a mutilated body. This might be the reason why 88% or 220 respondents fear ritual murders the most. The thought of seeing a dead body disheartens people and paints into people a gruesome picture, let alone seeing mutilated body murdered purposively for extraction body parts. People would construct mental pictures of how the deceased suffered excruciating death during the killing process which actually traumatizes survivors hence the fear gripping residents. The 55% respondents who have not seen might have heard as information of such heinous occurrence spreads fast. They could be part of the 94% respondents who have heard about human rights abuses related to trafficking body parts. The above scenario is a clear indication that people in the three corners of the GLTP feel unprotected hence the fear. Due to the fact that the area under study lies in some of the remotest parts of the three countries, these clandestine crimes will continue if improved protective mechanisms are not put in place.
The above diagram represents the total number of body parts found missing from mutilated bodies. This study found out that out the 15 dead bodies families accounted that 12 of the victims had their genitals missing. 7 of the bodies had head, tongue and teeth removed, while 5 had hands and arms; legs and toes missing. Only two bodies were found with ribs removed. There is evidence that perpetrators removed multiple body parts but top on their targets are genitals. The research team is unsure why genitals are top of body parts wanted. Some bodies were virtually found with very little remains like in the case of Patience Muchima (3) whose head and intestines were the only remains found in a cooler box. If it was not for the head and face Chipo Mary Mabvarume was no longer able to recognize her daughter. Leonard Gundani (33) was found without head cap, left hand, right leg and genitals. In the case for Patience, the perpetrator is alleged to have been selling the body parts, while Leonard’s missing parts were seen in cold rooms of a Chiredzi businessman. Key informant allege that a worker at this business enterprise resigned and retired home as a result of frequent traumatization he faced on daily basis due to exposure to human body parts like other pieces of pork or beef ready to be sold. The worker refused to talk to research team for fear of being tracked down since the businessman was an alleged ruthless person known in the town of Chiredzi.
71% (178) respondents allege that body parts are trafficked across borders into RSA. 17% (42) respondents claim that destination was Mozambique while 12% (30) respondents say body parts end up in Zimbabwe. Although RSA has a very high number it is significant to say that all three countries are sources and destinations for body parts signifying that the practice is common in the region. Mozambicans are alleged to be conservative with information but the AMETRAMO provincial secretary confided in the research team that in one of their meetings in the northern provinces they were exposed to some body parts mixed with muti as testimony of members’ evil practices and misuse of the traditional healers authority. In Zimbabwe, Chipinge district on the south eastern border with Mozambique was cited for harboring witchdoctors notoriously known practising mixture of muti and human body parts. The research heard accounts of witchdoctors along Limpopo, passing through Kruger National Park into Thoyohandou and surrounding areas. On passing by this city the research team talked to residents who narrated that the previous week there was a demonstration led by youths and residents over non conviction of ritual murders in one week. Media reports of the daily Mirror, a South African tabloid reveal that hardly a day passes without police in that area receiving cases related to ritual murders.
85% (213) respondents said body parts are mixed with muti, 15% (17) respondents claim that they are sold. On prodding what happens when these parts are mixed very few people are aware but speculate that the perpetrators hide them in their business premises. It is alleged live human body parts have a certain measure of power which if mixed with muti invite customers to use the business entity more than any other of the same. These scenarios were cited by the Chiredzi informants who alleged local businessman’s cold rooms stashed with body parts and a miller in Chief Sengwe where genitals were found. The practice of ritual murders has deep roots in African belief systems of strengthening one’s social status. However, the crime is increasing exponentially and perpetrators becoming sophisticated with knowledge of laws enacted in the countries under study. 15% of the respondents claiming that body parts are sold might not be sure that human parts have a commercial market for what purposes. It is easy to be persuaded to think that selling would be the objective for killing like in the case of Patience Muchima whose remains head and intestines were found in a cooler box. It is easier to picture the perpetrator was selling piece by piece according to choice of the buyers. Because if it was a buyer needs the whole body no remains could have been found. Analysing the role of the police Chipo Mary the mother after demonstrating the remains of her daughter are alleged to have instructed her to take courage and bury Patience’s remains without further arrests of the perpetrators till to date. It is the conclusion by the research team that even when buyers flock to buy the body parts of their choice they end up being mixed by muti and buried or hidden at someone’s business venture for the same purpose to lure customers so that the beneficiary gets rich fast.

20) Personal Accounts and Testimonies

1. Mozambique Immigration – Chicualacuala
The immigration officer manning the post professed that, “unconfirmed reports of bodies were found here at Chicualacuala without certain parts, but I have never seen one myself. However, I have heard numerous cases from my home district in Inhambane.” He went to stress that anything is possible given the porosity of the border between Mozambique and Zimbabwe. The officer could not shed more light as the subject was not part of his job description so he confirmed the existence of the practice in general.

2. Ministry of Agriculture Staff - Zimbabwe

The Ministry of Agriculture official confided in the research team that, “One day during my visits there was an incident at Machinda Business Centre Chief Chilonga, Chiredzi South where we were attracted to crowds of people milling around one shop. When we stopped to enquire what had brought many people together we found out that human private body parts were discovered at a local miller”. Asked why these parts were at the miller’s place the official narrated these would be mixed with “muti” and hid inside the mill supposedly to call the customers.

3. Interview with Traditional Healer Secretary for (AMETRAMO) from the Northern provinces

The secretary confirmed existence of the practice. “Yes there are people with power, money and status who practice use of muti. Most of them have left use of cheap muti in preference of the all powerful live human body parts. The practice is in existence although I have never been involve but I saw with my own eyes during one provincial meetings when the authorities brought evidence of evil some of our members have turned to be; male genitals mixed with muti and kept in a calabash fresh and active. Asked by researcher why the secretary said, “There are some witchdoctors who proclaim fake powers from traditional ancestors. They ply their trade with witches known for evil practices making people suffer by casting curses to identified vulnerable people in order to get paid after they succeeded cleansing the curse. These criminals do not rely upon spiritual endowment from ancestors but learned through observation from someone spiritually endowed. Some of them are opportunists who depend on experimentation of trial and error so would not be registered.” This scenario was confirmed by Nemadimbo Sara of Vhembe district in RSA.

4. Chiredzi District Police Station

The lead consultant was waiting at reception to be attended for making formal presentation of the research team and objectives to the District Police Internal Security Intelligence official responsible for crimes related to Trafficking in Persons and body parts, police details lamented the trauma one family is experiencing due to disappearance of their two children. “One can feel the pain the mother of these missing children is going through now.” “Some children are coming from school while she is thinking whether her children will be found alive.” The other policemen said, “She will never find them alive here in Chiredzi, there are too many unresolved cases and the numbers are increasing daily. This year only twelve cases have been reported.” As formal presentation procedures the consultant then tried to find out more details on the story, information was denied. Let alone shedding light regarding the twelve reported cases. This was a case of inadequate preparedness by law enforcement agents lamenting inconclusive cases that are increasing by day.

5. Conductor of Minibus plying between Chiredzi Town and Chikombedzi

The researcher acting as advance team leader boarded a minibus from Chiredzi Town to Chikombedzi about 120 kilometres south wards towards one of the many undesignated entry points into RSA. Motivated by diverse backgrounds of passengers shown through dress codes, I befriended the conductor for more information. He in turn was friendly enough to confide in the researcher that
the route was very popular among cross border jumpers from as far as northern countries like Malawi, Zambia, Tanzania, DRC including Zimbabweans and Mozambicans who desire to settle for better life in RSA. Asked on ritual murders, he had this to say,

“I have heard many stories, uncounted stories about ritual murders, however, one day, I have transported 4 girls who really looked frightened, couldn’t speak local language. Their male guide always spoke on behalf of them every time someone wants to talk to them. 2 days later I heard one of the girls was found dead with genital missing.” Asked if he could shed more details, he said, “brother let us end there I do not want to be on record for divulging this information. The Police are aware of this issue but did not do anything about it, so am I”? The fear factor.

6. FMAST supervisor talked about an elderly woman found dead at Chikombedzi Business Centre with eyes gouged, tongue and genitals missing. Extended family members alleged to have caused death

7. Chikombedzi Mission Hospital Assistant Administrator 2 months previously (July 2013) travelled to Chiredzi General Hospital for purposes of delivering her new baby. On arrival there she was strongly warned by both relatives and hospital staff that she should never share or give her baby to any “Good Samaritan” looking stricter. She confided in the researcher that one woman gave her newly born baby to someone who disembarked a nice car on the pretext of helping since the mother was carrying bags and buckets. The “Good Samaritan” flee into a nearby bush and vanished with the baby. On alerting police through telecommunications the Chiredzi – Ngundu road was blocked searching every vehicle till the baby was found, chopped and stuffed in a plastic bucket. Police brought perpetrators back to Chiredzi Police station for apprehension.

8. Reverend Baloyi, Superintendent for Free Methodist Church responsible for FMAST at Chikombedzi. He helped me with identification and selection of Data Collectors. Solome Mayeyisa couldn’t make it due to family commitment and Reverend opted for Amina Makondo was there and tasked to work around Chikombedzi while key informants operate in Chiredzi town.

Mapai is an Administrative Post that is a main road construction hub into the Great Limpopo Trans-frontier Park on the Mozambican side. A booming economic enterprise is attracting thousands of businesspeople and opportunists alike. The research visited the Post to capture stories surrounding the area. 18 people attended the workshop including Chief of the Administrative Post and 6 community leaders of 16 de Junho, 4 Outubro, 1 Bairro, 1st Secretary of FRELIMO at the Post.

9. Noah Feijao Macuacua and Sainora Feijao Macuacua

Grandmothers of the 11 year old deceased – The boy disappeared while Sainora was in the field. A village searching team looked all over the places surrounding villages and forests for a month from April to May 2013 to no avail. -----------------was eventually found dead about 3 kilometres away from his home. His naked body was in advanced state of decomposition although not to an extent depicting a month’s death. Relatives were advised by both police and health officials, “to bury him where we found him”. -----------------’s remains did not show signs of having died on the day or after his disappearance prompting questions of where he had been all along, with whom being used for what purposes. According to Jorge Zephaniah Chauque the uncle who identified -----------------’s body “more questions remain unanswered, why would he be naked where he was found him, he had no signs of sickness or medical record for insanity. However, with all these questions no autopsy of the boy’s remains was done. I am sure the child was used for ritual purposes because we couldn’t have found the body in the state we found him. We couldn’t substantiate footprints. What is clear to us is that the boy was abducted by local people not far from here. I suspect ritual murderers.” This view was shared by Sainora, the grandmother
of the deceased, who at the time of the interview was still shocked and blamed witchcraft and ritual murders practitioners. She hears that people take, kill, cut body parts but in this case I am not sure since the body was decomposed. Community Leader Ernesto Dumazi Matuase claimed, “this was the first time we heard about this gruesome act in this community but we hear it happens elsewhere. Its time now as community leaders we start mobilizing people, educate and form vigilant groups among community members and stop body parts which businesspeople for various reasons and getting quick wealth.” Justice Fenias Chauque another local community leader said this was a revelation.

10. Leonard Gundani (33 years) was found dead by the railway road line in 2 months ago. Martha Gundani mother of the deceased said the upper cap of the head, genitals and left arm and right leg were missing. On the fateful day Leonard is alleged to have gone to the town centre in search for livestock feed since he was running a piggery project. He was last seen very drunk at the local bar run by one of the notorious businessman well known for trafficking body parts. It is also the same business entity where one informant who refused testifying on camera about resigning for his job due to incessant trauma experienced due to exposure to human body parts in the businessman’s cold rooms. Leonard’s remains were however found the following morning lying by the railway line. It was alleged that the remains were meant to be crushed by the evening goods trains plying frequently along that part of the town. Incidentally, Leonard was seemingly dragged to the place he was found as a trail of blood came closer to the notorious businessman’s bar. Martha enquired how she felt had this to say, “There is nothing for me to hide now that the breadwinner of my family is gone, I want justice. Killers must be apprehended and brought here before my eyes because they are known. They are alleged to be keeping my son’s body parts in the refrigerators for their business to prosper. I am left alone taking care of these children. My husband died a mysterious death, today my son. My plight will never end. We are squatters here after being evicted by the Minister who took over the farm we all grew up in. However, Leonard’s children languish in abject poverty without going to school, clothes and food while living in squalid conditions as shown in pictures.

Figure 11

Martha Gundani and Leonard’s children at their home

11. Chipo Mary Mabvarume (35 years) of Nerutanga Secondary School 605 Buhera, Zimbabwe. Mother of Patience Muchima (3years) stayed in Rujeko plots in Masvingo with husband from 2001 until early this year when he decided to marry second wife. In February 2013 Patience disappeared for 4 days. A search team combed the whole area but couldn’t find Patience. On the fourth day Chipo on tip off from a young girl discovered her daughter decapitated with only head and intestines left but stashed in the second wife’s cooler box. “I was shocked and started crying ceaselessly and uncontrollably for I did not know what to do. I asked again if it was true that I was looking for my daughter for 3 days when you actually know that you have her in your cooler box.” Chipo was already sobbing tears running down her chicks reminded of the trauma of how she lost her daughter. “Neighbours started streaming to our house...
to find out why I was crying. When I showed the Patience’s head and intestines they were gripped with anger that they wanted to man-handle the lady who surprisingly ran away like a bullet and was never seen. She later came back with my husband who seemingly was unconcerned. People started telling my husband that he was bewitched by his second wife, but that did not move him at all. They just disappeared when Police arrived and advised me to bury the remains.” It is alleged no post-mortem was conducted. Chipo says, “husband and wife were never seen again although people allege to have met my husband doing his business. Chipo decided to go back to her parents’ home where she is receiving family counselling and encouragement but no police statement and the redress of law over such gruesome death of an innocent child.

12. Maxwell Charumbira (35 years) of 592 Gwaku Street Chiredzi had his uncle (Mother’s brother) Owen Nyamadzawo of Chief Mupandawashe Nyamweda Mhondoro who was found murdered after he went into the bush to collect firewood for a family traditional function. Owen was searched for the day until he was found with deep open gush on the head with the brain tissues missing. Maxwell said, “My uncle was murdered on 17th April 2013 when the family were preparing for independence celebrations the following day. Instead of celebrating we were in mourning. Up until today we are not aware who the perpetrators were. It is still a mystery why it happened. The entire family is shocked.” Maxwell called the deceased’s wife who on the phone was continuously sobbing endlessly interjecting saying the research team were the only people who had shown interest in her husband’s death outside family members and villagers. No post-mortem was done Owen was buried at the advice of the local headman.

13. Sophia Muzimba (37 years) narrated the story of Gogo Musengi (80 years) Sophia a maternal granddaughter missed her grandmother on Friday morning in June 2013. The following Saturday the whole village started looking for her. “We knew she had no habit of visiting without notifying. On Tuesday, when we eventually disturbed by stench – smell around her hut but no one thought of looking into her house because the door was tightly closed with cloths stripes of different materials including a drum at the door. So it was a disguise to cover people, however, when we eventually went inside we discovered her private parts were missing. The disturbing fact was who had closed with a drum and clothes for what reason.” Case was reported but no arrests were made even post-mortem was not conducted to determine death of such an old woman.

14. Mrs Mhembere Grinding mill owner at Chikombedz Business Centre also running piggery project was found dead in August 2013 after returning from village funeral. She was discovered early morning with
genitals removed by sharp instrument. Some Family members refused key informants to take story on video due to differences among themselves because some are involved. Young man suspected to have caused death was arrested but long since released. Police couldn’t shed light if this was in their books as a criminal record or not.

15. Sarinah Ndou a 4 year girl and 5th born of Josephine Ndou of Chief Nemalale village in Vhembe district was found with no legs, no hands only head and ribs when she was eventually found on 16 July 2013. Ndala Ndou (21 years) called Sarinah to go and buy bread at a local shop but didn’t come back as she remained on the forefront of the dam when she claimed to be afraid to pass through small narrow path across the dam. On the way back Ndala claimed to have met Lady Maem who was carrying bath bowl coming from the dam. She asked, “How many were you when you passed?” I responded that were 3 and she said, “Where is the other one?” Ndala then said maybe she went home. When home they couldn’t find the girl and when grandmother Rebecca arrived home she enquired where Sarinah was. “We started to panic and we alerted the Chief who in turn quickly summoned his men and women who immediately started searching everywhere to no avail.” Sarinah’s remains were found decomposed and had a string on her neck. Lady Maem who asked the team from the dam was arrested for 4 days but was released forever. “Police told us to bury Sarinah and promised to come back with report but they never did.” Ndala was the most devastated when asked by the research team how he felt. “When I went with Sarinah to the shop I did not realize that was going to be the last time to see her only to meet her dead. I am more pained especially when I was burying my cousin without her all of her body parts.” Josephine said, “I wish perpetrators to be caught and arrested. If it was natural death I would accept but this was weird taken to be killed in the bush. I suspect her parts were taken by those who usually use muti for businesses like tuck shops to enrich their power and wealth.”

16. Amusi Khetheni Kwinda (24 years) narrated the story of his father Francis Kwinda born in 1952. My father was found hanging by his shirt. His genitals and all toes were missing. Blood was dripping indicating that a sharp instrument was used to remove the body parts. Police wrote the report on tissue paper. One of the witnesses who saw what happened was told by the police that he was lying so he should keep quiet if he doesn’t know what he is talking of. No docket was opened to access witnessed due to law prohibitions. Amusi said talking to the witness at family level, “My father was tracked and targeted during the weekend and perpetrators came up with his drinking patterns.”

17. David Tshikovhi and Tshnavhuyo Makuvhile are a newly settled couple in Malale village. We are very sad that our daughter 3 years old Sana was a target of such heinous crime. I am not happy because these people might come again and take my child and kill her for their purposes. David alleges that perpetrators have internal coordinator who track children and study parents’ lifestyles. In our case we are all workers we spend most of the day away. We are really frightened. I am very happy for quick thinking and intervention Phalendwa Tshiawelo of Malale Primary School (12 years) brother to Sana’s Mother) who had this to say; “I didn’t go to school that day when I decided to join the team of children who were playing at the neighbours I then went on riding my bicycle when I came back to see Sana was in the car being given sweets, potato crisps called Simba and jiggies by an Indian and black guys. I asked her to get out of the car. The two gentlemen started talking to each other and took off with her but followed behind on my bicycle shouting on top of my voice. They stopped near the pre-school and dropped Sana with her sweets and jiggles. The car sped off to the tarred road out of the village and Sana was with us again.” Asked if he knew that there were people stealing children and killing them he said, “Yes, at school we were informed that we should always be on the look out for Indian people come to take children away and disappear forever. Twins are target because of belief that they come with luck”. Meanwhile Sana’s parents said it was very painful since they came to the village as a new couple, “Neighbours advised us not to talk about this case we were new.”
21) Notable Workshop Comments @ Malale Drift Vhembe District.

a) John Mkwevo
“It is evident in this village when we go out to look for animals, we are afraid for our children. We are not sure what will happen to them any moment. We really feel insecure.”

b) David Tshaka 35 years
“We have a challenge here in R.S.A we have seen mutilated bodies. Each time this happens the police say there is no compelling evidence. As a result people are afraid to report these kinds of criminals”

c) Irene Munyai (Community leader)
In February 2000, March of following years, June 2004, 2006, 2009 since then every year; a child goes missing up to now some of them have not been found. Late last year a skull was found in the bush. It was reported and the Chief’s court was promised feedback. Justice has not been done. No help was rendered up to now. A villager was found hanging the police didn’t do anything. It is risk leaving children alone because children are being butchered or abducted. Malale has a problem and should be taken seriously

d) Tobo Hazvindini
We are told that parts are taken to business people Sangomas Inyanga are taking private parts to use in their practices

e) Elphas Nemalale, 27 years
I think there is a company in South Africa that is hiring people to murder the vulnerable and unprotected in our communities then they buy from killers. Police doesn’t do anything. Less than 3 months a child was rescued from a car without number plates. Parents need to monitor their children very closely when they use social networks, facebook, twitter, you tube and others because people are hooked up to be killed and we have heard stories whereby lovers are killing each other.

David Tshikovhi and Tshnavhuyo Makuvhile are a newly settled couple in Malale village. We are very sad that our daughter 3 years old Sana was a target of such heinous crime. I am not happy because these people might come again and take my child and kill her for their purposes. David alleges that perpetrators
have internal coordinator who track children and study parents’ lifestyles. In our case we are all workers we spend most of the day away. We are really frightened. I am very happy for quick thinking and intervention Phalendwa Tshiawelo of Malale Primary School (12 years) brother to Sana’s Mother) who had this to say; “I didn’t go to school that day when I decided to join the team of children who were playing at the neighbours I then went on riding my bicycle when I came back to see Sana was in the car being given sweets, potato crisps called Simba and jiggies by an Indian and black guys. I asked her to get out of the car. The two gentlemen started talking to each other and took off with her but followed behind on my bicycle shouting on top of my voice. They stopped near the pre-school and dropped Sana with her sweets and jiggles. The car sped off to the tarred road out of the village and Sana was with us again.”

Asked if he knew that there were people stealing children and killing them he said, “Yes, at school we were informed that we should always be on the look out for Indian people come to take children away and disappear forever. Twins are target because of belief that they come with luck”. Meanwhile Sana’s parents said it was very painful since they came to the village as a new couple, “Neighbours advised us not to talk about this case we were new.”

22) Conclusion

Trafficking body parts is taking place as evidenced by research findings. It is also increasing with law enforcement unable to stop it due to limitations of implementing available laws. Law enforcement agents have low capacity to intercept perpetrators or pursue investigations to desirable conclusions. Most police officers were never equipped with skills to counteract trafficking body parts. The little Governments are doing now with enactment and domestication of laws is far too behind highly organized operations of the criminals. The GLTP and its adjacent districts are poor remote areas suffering from acute shortage of service provision. There are no employment opportunities, limited communication; poor road networks, education and health facilities to cater for desirable livelihoods of the residents. Respondents live in perpetual fear hence resorting to own means to survive the heinous crimes. They are mobilizing residents of their communities to form vigilant groups to defend their people. They are not sure, when criminals will visit them, but are aware of organized, well-resourced cartels operating at free will. Respondents pointed out that Indians are major human rights violators although they work with some African front men and women, who select target community probably due to weak security measures, identify vulnerable people, study their movements and pounce on the victim before disappearing for sometime. They then extract body parts of their choice, which are taken to witchdoctors. These are alleged to be bogus, fake and unregistered people depending on cheating and experimentation. It was also discovered that witchdoctors do not kill themselves but ask beneficiaries to bring specific body parts that will be mixed with “muti”. Two Traditional Healers who are certified according to their respective Government laws claim that no ancestral spirits will instruct anyone to bring live human body parts to administer treatment. Although all the three countries share numbers for witchdoctors claimed to be associating with criminals alleged to practice killings for commercial purposes, South Africa has the highest numbers probably because of the stability in the economy.

23) Recommendations

✓ Conducting a regional research findings dissemination workshop of human rights partners and stakeholders to share documented evidence as a way to improve coordination efforts for reducing impact of trafficking body parts in the region.
✓ A regional advocacy plan should be put in place to lobby traditional healers associations and empower them to weed out and shame bogus, fake and unregistered witchdoctors masquerading as spirit mediums hence tarnishing the image of the registered associations serving and doing a good job.
Zimbabwe should finalize and pass draft anti-trafficking legislation consistent with the 2000 UN TIP Protocol; investigate and prosecute trafficking offenses; convict and punish trafficking offenders using existing legislation; formalize procedures for identifying victims and transferring them to the care of appropriate governmental or non-governmental service providers.

All countries under study should train more officials on victim identification and referral procedures, as well as relevant legislation; provide financial or in-kind support to NGOs and international organizations offering victim services;

All countries under study must incorporate trafficking crimes into police procedures for recording and reporting crime data; continue the broad awareness-raising campaign on the nature of trafficking and the availability of assistance for victims; and accede to the 2000 UN TIP Protocol.

All countries under study must disseminate widely user-friendly versions of available legislation to remote but vulnerable populations to empower and protect them against highly organized criminals. In the area under study people lamented poor protective mechanisms for people but are aware of very strong and clear stringent anti-poaching laws and policies.

There is evidence for the need for mass media campaigns to educate the populations of the area under study. Campaigns empower people with information which improves both individual and communal protection against the crimes of trafficking body parts.

SANTAC, LDH and their national and regional partners should lobby SADC governments to improve poverty reduction mechanisms, implement social welfare safety nets, and employment creation policies to reduce impact of vulnerability and susceptibility to the heinous crimes like trafficking body parts.

24) Annexes
   a. Research Tool
   b. Judgement of perpetrators